

DISTRICT COURT OF THE VIRGIN ISLANDS
DIVISION OF ST. THOMAS AND ST. JOHN

MRL Development I, LLC and MICHAEL R.)
LUCHT,)

Plaintiffs,)

v.)

Civil No. 2013-48

WHITECAP INVESTMENT CORP., d/b/a)
PARADISE LUMBER; PUTNAM LUMBER &)
EXPORT CO.; PUTNAM FAMILY PROPERTIES,)
INC.; and GREAT SOUTHERN WOOD)
PRESERVING, INC.,)

Defendants.)

WHITECAP INVESTMENT CORP., d/b/a)
PARADISE LUMBER,)

Cross-claimant,)

v.)

PUTNAM LUMBER & EXPORT CO.; PUTNAM)
FAMILY PROPERTIES, INC.; and GREAT)
SOUTHERN WOOD PRESERVING, INC.,)

Cross-claim defendant.)

PUTNAM FAMILY PROPERTIES, INC.,)

Cross-claimant,)

v.)

WHITECAP INVESTMENT CORP., d/b/a)
PARADISE LUMBER; and GREAT SOUTHERN)
WOOD PRESERVING, INC.,)

Cross-claim defendants.)

MRL Development I, LLC v. Whitecap Investment Corp.
Civil No. 2013-48
Order
Page 2

PUTNAM LUMBER & EXPORT COMPANY,
Cross-claimant,
v.
WHITECAP INVESTMENT CORP., d/b/a
PARADISE LUMBER; and GREAT SOUTHERN
WOOD PRESERVING, INC.,
Cross-claim defendant.

ATTORNEYS:

David A. Bornn, Esq.

The Bornn Firm, PLLC
St. Thomas, VI

Paul Martin Platte, Esq.

Columbia, SC

For the Plaintiffs,

Chad C. Messier, Esq.

Alex Moskowitz, Esq.

Dudley, Topper & Feuerzeig
St. Thomas, VI

*For the defendant/cross-claimant Whitecap Investment Corp.
d/b/a Paradise Lumber,*

Lisa M. Komives, Esq.

Bolt Nagi PC
St. Thomas, VI

Robert A. Carlson, Esq.

Lee, Hernandez, Landrum, Garofalo and Blake APC
Miami, FL

*For the defendants/cross-claimaints Putnam Lumber & Export
Co. and Putnam Family Properties, Inc,*

Daryl C. Barnes, Esq.

Bryant, Barnes, Moss & Beckstedt
St. Croix, VI

Stewart Andrew Kelly, Esq.

Lightfoot, Franklin & White, LLC
Birmingham, AL

*For the defendant/cross-claim defendant Great Southern Wood
Preserving, Inc.*

MRL Development I, LLC v. Whitecap Investment Corp.
Civil No. 2013-48
Order
Page 3

ORDER

GÓMEZ, J.

Before the Court is the Report and Recommendation of the Magistrate which addresses the motions for attorneys' fees and costs of Great Southern Wood Preserving, Inc.; Putnam Family Properties, Inc.; Putnam Lumber and Export Company; and Whitecap Investment Corporation.

Great Southern Wood Preserving, Inc. ("GSWP") is an Alabama lumber wholesaler. In addition to selling wood, it also provides chemical and pressure treatments to prevent lumber from decaying. The ostensible purpose of such treatments is to render the lumber safe for use in buildings.

From in or about 2003 until in or about 2009, GSWP regularly sold treated lumber and provided lumber-treatment services to the defendant/cross-claimant Putnam Family Properties, then doing business as Putnam Lumber and Export Company ("Putnam Family"). Putnam Family later sold its wood export business and name to defendant/cross-claimant Putnam Lumber and Export Co. ("Putnam Lumber") (Putnam Family and Putnam Lumber are collectively referred to herein as the "Putnam Defendants").

Putnam Family, a Florida corporation, was itself a lumber retailer. Putnam Family regularly sold lumber to, among others,

MRL Development I, LLC v. Whitecap Investment Corp.
Civil No. 2013-48
Order
Page 4

the defendant/cross-claimant Whitecap Investment Corporation,
doing business as Paradise Lumber ("Paradise Lumber").

Paradise Lumber is a lumber retailer operating in St. John,
United States Virgin Islands. It sold lumber that it had
purchased from Putnam Family, and which had been treated by
GSWP, to various consumers in St. John. These consumers used the
lumber in their sundry buildings. Two of these consumers are the
plaintiffs in the instant case, MRL Development I, LLC ("MRL
Dev.") and Michael R. Lucht ("Lucht") (collectively "MRL").

MRL claims that the GSWP-treated lumber, sold by the Putnam
Defendants, prematurely decayed, causing damage to its house,
into which the lumber had been incorporated.

MRL initiated this matter on February 15, 2013, in the
Superior Court of the Virgin Islands. The amended complaint (the
"Complaint") named GSWP, Paradise Lumber, and the Putnam
Defendants as defendants. The Complaint included six counts: (1)
breach of contract against Paradise Lumber; (2) breach of
contract against the Putnam Defendants; (3) breach of warranty
against all defendants; (4) negligence against all defendants;
(5) strict liability against all defendants; and (6) deceptive
trade practices against all defendants.

On May 14, 2013, GSWP removed the action to this Court.
Following discovery, and approximately one month before trial,
the defendants filed several motions for total or partial

MRL Development I, LLC v. Whitecap Investment Corp.
Civil No. 2013-48
Order
Page 5

summary judgment. On November 18, 2014, the Court granted summary judgment for all defendants. MRL appealed. In a May 17, 2016, opinion, the Third Circuit affirmed the Court's granting of summary judgment for all defendants.

GSWP, the Putnam Defendants, and Paradise Lumber now move for attorneys' fees and costs pursuant to 5 V.I.C. § 541 (the "motions"). GSWP seeks \$221,962 in attorneys' fees and \$30,531 in costs. The Putnam Defendants seek \$136,494 in attorneys' fees and \$37,896.43 in costs. Paradise Lumber seeks \$230,456.50 in attorneys' fees and \$24,607.49 in costs. MRL objects to an award of attorney's fees and costs. On February 13, 2017, the Court referred the motions to the Magistrate Judge for a Report and Recommendation.

The Magistrate has since submitted a report in which she recommends that GSWP be awarded \$174,410 in fees and \$21,127.16 in costs; the Putnam Defendants be awarded \$114,684.50 in fees

MRL Development I, LLC v. Whitecap Investment Corp.
Civil No. 2013-48
Order
Page 6

and \$15,007.47 in costs; and, that Paradise Lumber be awarded \$172,377.75 in fees and \$15,398.36 in costs.

Upon de novo review of the record, the Court agrees with the Magistrate Judge. Accordingly, it is hereby

ORDERED that the Report and Recommendation of the Magistrate Judge is **ADOPTED**; it is further

ORDERED that Great Southern Wood Preserving is awarded \$174,410.00 in fees and \$21,127.16 in costs; it is further

ORDERED that Putnam Family Properties, Inc. and Putnam Lumber and Export Company collectively¹ are awarded \$114,684.50 in fees and \$15,007.47 in costs; and it is further

ORDERED that Whitecap Investment Corp. is awarded \$172,377.75 in fees and \$15,398.36 in costs.

s/ _____
CURTIS V. GÓMEZ
District Judge

¹ Putnam Family Properties, Inc. and Putnam Lumber and Export Company share a unity of interest. They also share the same counsel in this matter.